26

27

Plaintiff filed an unopposed motion for preliminary approval of the class and representative action settlement on August 4, 2023. The Court issued an order on October 13, 2023, identifying issues with the settlement agreement, notice, and proposed order. Plaintiff submits this supplement to address the Court's concerns.

As to the Settlement:

Issue 1: The definition of Class Period (Agr. ¶ 11) needs to be revised as it vague and undefined, i.e., "[i]t is the period to which the Release of Claims Applies." This period should be limited to the "Released California Claims."

Response: The definition of "Class Period" has been revised to: the "time period from September 24, 2014 through August 29, 2023. It is the period to which the Released California Claims applies," limiting the time period to the Released California Claims. *See* Amendment to Agreement for Settlement of Class and PAGA Claims ("Amendment") ¶ 1, attached hereto as Exhibit 1.

Issue 2: Paragraph 51(g)) states the award amount "[w]ill be based on" workweeks. This is imprecise. It should affirmatively state how the amounts will be calculated. In other words, the precise formula should be made express in the actual Settlement.

Response: Paragraph 51(g) of the Settlement Agreement has been revised to: "The Net Settlement Fund from which Eligible Class Members will receive their Class Member Award. Class Member Awards will be calculated using a percentage from diving the Eligible Class Member's Work Weeks by the total Eligible Class Member Work Weeks," which provides the precise formula for calculating the award amount. *See* Amendment ¶ 5.

Issue 3: The "Additional Settlement Payment" referenced in Agr. ¶ 52 is undefined. Presumably it is the PAGA payment, but this needs to be clarified.

Response: The inclusion of "Additional Settlement Payment" was an inadvertent mistake and has been deleted from Paragraph 52 of the Settlement Agreement. See Amendment ¶ 6.

Issue 4: Wages comprise the bulk of the overall valuation and part of the individual settlement payments is considered wages owed and thus the property of the class members. Accordingly,

Response: Paragraph 53(d) of the Settlement Agreement is revised to change the cy pres recipient to the State Controller's Office's Unclaimed Property Division to be held as unclaimed funds in the Eligible Class Members' names. See Amendment \P 7.

Issue 5: The Court requires an actual estimate or quote from the proposed Administrator.

Response: The quote submitted by Atticus is attached hereto as Exhibit 2.

Issue 6: Section 664.6 should be made express as the Court "shall retain jurisdiction to enforce the Agreement" lacks precision. (Agr. ¶ 14.)

Response: The definition of "Court" has been revised to: "the Superior Court of the State of California in the County of Orange, which shall retain jurisdiction pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6(a) to enforce this Agreement." *See* Amendment ¶ 2.

Issue 7: As to the Class and PAGA releases, Labor codes 221,222,223,225.5, 551, and 1182.12 are not in the LWDA letter or alleged the FAC. Why should they be expressly released and what, if any, valuation was done?

Response: The definitions of "Released California Claims" and "Released PAGA Claims" have been revised to remove references to Labor codes 221, 222, 223, 225.5, 551, and 1182.12.

See Amendment ¶¶ 3-4.

Issue 8: As to the Class Release, the language "any related damages, penalties, restitution, equitable relief, disgorgement, interest or attorneys' fees that arose during the Class Period" makes the release vague and overbroad and it should be deleted.

Response: The definition of "Released California Claims" has been revised to delete that language. See Amendment \P 3.

Issue 9: The Class Release is reasonably interpreted to include the FLSA claim as it was alleged in the FAC. If, as it appears, no value has been given for that claim for class members, why should this claim be released?

Response: The definition of "Released California Claims" has been revised to delete reference to federal law. The release now reads: "any and all claims, rights, demands, liabilities, and causes of action of any kind, whether known or unknown including any violation of common law, California law or local law, which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged in the complaints, including but not limited to claims based on California Labor Code sections 201, 202, 203, 204-204b, 210, 226, 226.2, 226.3, 226.7, 256, 510, 512, 558, 1174, 1194, 1194.2, 1197, 1197.1, and 1198 California Code of Regulations, Title 8 Sections 11000 and 11090, the applicable Industrial Welfare Commission (IWC) Wage Orders, Business & Professions Code sections 17200 *et seq.* This provision is only applicable to Eligible Class Members." *See* Amendment ¶ 3.

Issue 10: As to the PAGA Release, the phrase "[r]elating to" renders the release vague and overbroad. The PAGA release should be limited to claims for civil penalties under Cal. Labor Code § 2698 et seq. as alleged in the operative complaint, the LWDA notice, or which could have been brought based on the factual allegations therein.

Response: The definition of "Released PAGA Claims" has been revised to delete "relating to" and limits the release to penalties as alleged in the operative complaint, the LWDA notice, or which could have been brought based on the factual allegations therein. The release now reads: "any claims for civil penalties under the California Private Attorneys General Act, California Labor Code section 2698 et. seq. for violations listed and based on the facts alleged in Plaintiff Lawson's June 4, 2018 letter to the California Labor & Workforce Development Agency or the First Amended Complaint, or which could have been brought based on the factual allegations therein, including violations of California Labor Code sections, 201, 202, 203, 204-204b, 210, 226, 226.2, 226.3, 226.7, 256, 510, 512, , 558, 1714, 1714.5, 1194, 1194.2, 1197, 1197.1, 1198, that accrued during the Aggrieved Employees' employment during the PAGA Period." See Amendment ¶ 4.

Issue 11: Counsel must provide proof the FAC and Preliminary Approval papers were timely served on the LWDA.

Response: A screenshot showing the upload of the First Amended Complaint, Settlement Agreement, and Motion for Preliminary Approval of Settlement to the LWDA website is attached hereto as Exhibit 3.

Ussue 12: Are there any fee-sharing, referral fee, or like agreements related to this action? If so

Issue 12: Are there any fee-sharing, referral fee, or like agreements related to this action? If so, explain.

Response: There are no fee-sharing, referral fee, or like agreements related to this action.

<u>As to the Notice:</u>

Issue 13: Both releases are reproduced in the Notice and, accordingly, the same problems identified above apply. Additionally, the Court prefers the use of simplified versions of releases in the Notice.

Response: The Releases in the Notice have been updated to match those in the Settlement Agreement and simplified. *See* Notice of Class Action Settlement ¶ 11, submitted herewith.

Issue 14: As to the request for exclusion form, it should differentiate the PAGA portion of the Settlement and include a statement that a PAGA payment will be made regardless.

Response: The statement on the request for exclusion form has been revised to read: "I WISH TO BE EXCLUDED FROM THE SETTLEMENT CLASS. I UNDERSTAND THAT IF I ASK TO BE EXCLUDED FROM THE SETTLEMENT CLASS, I WILL NOT RECEIVE A CLASS MEMBER AWARD. HOWEVER, I WILL STILL RECEIVE A PAGA AWARD IF ELIGIBLE." *See* Notice of Class Action Settlement, Class Member Opt-Out Form.

Issue 15: Counsel or the Administrator needs to make a copy of the Final Judgment available for at least 90 days after it is entered and the Notice should state the location it can be accessed and for what length of time.

Response: Counsel will make a copy of the Final Judgment available for at least 90 days after it is entered. Paragraph 19 of the Notice has been revised to state that the Final Judgment will be available at the same website where the Settlement Agreement will be made available, for at least 90 days after it is entered.

Exhibit 1

Pursuant to the Court's instructions in its minute order issued October 13, 2023, this

Amendment revises the Agreement for Settlement of Class and PAGA Claims ("Settlement

Agreement") entered into by Plaintiff James Lawson and Opt-in Plaintiff Christopher J. Daniels, on
one hand, and Defendant Consumer Portfolio Services, Inc ("CPS" or "Defendant") on the other
(collectively the "Parties"), which was fully executed on August 3, 2023. The Parties have agreed to
adopt the changes shown below, deleting the text that is in red and crossed out and adding the text that
is in red and underlined.

SECTION 1: RECITALS

No revisions are made to Section 1.

SECTION 2: DEFINITIONS

The following defined terms used in the Settlement Agreement are revised as follows:

- 1. <u>Class Period</u> (Settlement Agreement ¶ 11). "Class Period" is revised as follows: "time period from September 24, 2014 through August 29, 2023 or the date of preliminary approval, whichever first occurs. It is the period to which the Release of Claims Released California Claims applies."
- 2. <u>Court</u> (Settlement Agreement ¶ 14). "Court" is revised as follows: "the Superior Court of the State of California in the County of Orange, which shall retain jurisdiction <u>pursuant to California</u>

 <u>Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6(a)</u> to enforce this Agreement."
- 3. Released California Claims (Settlement Agreement ¶ 36). "Released California Claims" is revised as follows: "any and all claims, rights, demands, liabilities, and causes of action of any kind, whether known or unknown including any violation of common law, California law, or local law, and/or federal law which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged in the complaints, including but not limited to claims based on California Labor Code sections 201, 202, 203, 204-204b, 210, 221, 222, 223, 225.5, 226, 226.2, 226.3, 226.7, 256, 510, 512, 551, 558, 1174, 1182.12, 1194, 1194.2, 1197, 1197.1, and 1198, California Code of Regulations, Title 8 Sections 11000 and 11090, the applicable Industrial Welfare Commission (IWC) Wage Orders, Business & Professions Code sections 17200 *et seq*, and any related damages, penalties, restitution, equitable

relief, disgorgement, interest or attorneys' fees that arose during the Class Period. This provision is only applicable to Eligible Class Members."

4. Released PAGA Claims (Settlement Agreement ¶ 37). "Released PAGA Claims" is revised as follows: "any claims relating to for civil penalties under the California Private Attorneys General Act, California Labor Code section 2698 *et. seq.* for violations listed and based on the facts alleged in Plaintiff Lawson's June 4, 2018 letter to the California Labor & Workforce Development Agency or the First Amended Complaint, or which could have been brought based on the factual allegations therein, including violations of California Labor Code sections, 201, 202, 203, 204-204b, 210, 221, 222, 223, 225.5, 226, 226.2, 226.3, 226.7, 256, 510, 512, 551, 558, 1714, 1714.5, 1182.12, 1194, 1194.2, 1197, 1197.1, 1198, that accrued during the Aggrieved Employees' employment during the PAGA Period."

SECTION 3: TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF SETTLEMENT

The terms and conditions of the class settlement are revised as follows:

- 5. Allocation of Gross Settlement Amount Among LWDA, Eligible Class Members, Class Counsel, and Plaintiff, and Opt-in Plaintiff (Settlement Agreement ¶ 51) Subsection (g) of paragraph 51 is revised as follows: "The Net Settlement Fund from which Eligible Class Members will receive their Class Member Award. Class Member Awards will be based on each Eligible Class Member's Work Weeks in relation to the total Eligible Class Member Work Weeks calculated using a percentage from dividing the Eligible Class Member's Work Weeks by the total Eligible Class Member Work Weeks."
- 6. Payment of the Gross Settlement Amount and Distributions of Net Settlement Fund
 (Settlement Agreement ¶ 52). Paragraph 52 is revised as follows: "Upon entry of the Preliminary
 Approval Order, the Class Administrator shall forthwith establish all financial accounts necessary to
 establish the Qualified Settlement Fund. Within seven (7) calendar days of the Effective Date or such
 other date as the Court orders, Defendant shall deposit with the Class Administrator funds that are
 reasonable and necessary to pay for the Gross Settlement Amount, the Additional Settlement Payment,
 plus Defendant's share of payroll taxes. Checks shall be mailed by the Class Administrator within

seventeen (17) calendar days of the Effective Date. At Class Counsel's request, the Class Administrator shall pay any award to Class Counsel by check or by wire transfer, without charge, into such financial institution accounts as Class Counsel direct."

7. <u>Taxation and Withholding</u>; <u>Uncashed Settlement Checks</u> (Settlement Agreement ¶ 53). Subsection (d) of paragraph 53 is revised as follows: "Check Expiration and Refunds. The expiration date of any instruments of payment (such as checks) issued by the Class Administrator to Eligible Class Members will be one hundred eighty (180) calendar days from the date such instruments are issued. The amount of any instruments of payment that are not cashed, reissued, and/or otherwise negotiated by Eligible Class Members within one hundred eighty (180) calendar days of the date of mailing of the settlement checks or which are then undeliverable, shall go to ey pres recipient, Young Women's Freedom Center (https://youngwomenfree.org/investing-in-young-people/), an organization that empowers young people through providing quality mentorship, training, and employment opportunities to enable them to meet their economic needs and work on financial freedom, builds the power of young people to organize and advocate for system change, and provides sacred space and access for young people to explore healing practices and build confidence, agency, and power. With locations in Contra Costa County, Los Angeles, Oakland, San Francisco, and Santa Clara County, Young Women's Freedom Center qualifies as a "child advocacy program" under C.C.P. 382(b). the State Controller's Office's Unclaimed Property Division to be held as unclaimed funds in the Eligible Class Members' names. Following the date of expiration of all of the Class Member Award checks, the Class Administrator shall provide to Class Counsel and Defendant's Counsel a Class Administrator Declaration attesting that it has mailed the settlement checks to Eligible Class Members and caused the amounts of any uncashed settlement checks to go to the cy pres recipients be reported to the Unclaimed Property Division. The Class Administrator shall distribute funds to the cy pres recipient report funds to the Unclaimed Property Division within 30 calendar days of the expiration of the check."

It is so agreed.

2728

25

Dated: James Lawson, Plaintiff Dated: Christopher J. Daniels, Opt-in Plaintiff Dated: 11-14-23 Mike Lavin, on behalf of Defendant Consumer Portfolio Services, Inc.

Exhibit 2

Atticus Administration, LLC Mike Gelhar Director of QSF & Treasury Services

Lawson v. Consumer Portfolio Services

Prepared for

Byron R. Goldstein | Attorney brgoldstein@gbdhlegal.com P: 510.287.4324

Goldstein, Borgen, Dardarian & Ho 155 Grand Avenue, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612



Class Action Administration

Estimate E2023-06-E33 Lawson v. Consumer Portfolio Services

Prepared on July 12, 2023 By Mike Gelhar | Atticus Administration LLC

Estimate Summary

Atticus Services & Cost Description

NOTICE MAILING-Mailed First Class	\$1,457	
Initial Notice, 10-pages	Included	
Undeliverable/Return Mail Processing	Included	
English only	Included	
PROJECT MANAGEMENT/ADMIN FEES/Technical	\$2,760	
COMMUNICATIONS	\$513	
PO Box rental	Included	
IVR, 800#, live operators	Included	
correspondence, out-outs, objections	Included	
FUND, TAX, REPORTING	\$1,313	
setup QSF, file annual tax returns	included	
DISTRIBUTION	\$2,851	
check printing, payment calculation & verification, bank fees	included	
Small Case Discount	(\$317)	

TOTAL: \$8,577

Key Assumptions

- Class Size: 30 class members.
- Notices in English (10 pages).
- Data review, cleansing and preparing file for mailing; including NCOA, and new address searches (skip-tracing).
- Communications includes various mail correspondence.
- Communications includes dedicated 800#, live operators and IVR.
- Employment reporting for one state (CA)
- Class Member reporting will consist of W2's and/or 1099's.
- Includes one distribution to class members.
- Not to Exceed \$10,000 in Administrative Fees.

Client Signature

By signing above, I understand and agree to the pricing terms and services to be provided by Atticus Administration for the stated project.

PLEASE NOTE: This estimate and pricing is for the services stated herein and is valid for 30 days from the date of the estimate. If the Settlement Agreement or other service scope document(s) require additional services not included or priced in this estimate, we will separately price those scope changes and submit an updated quote prior to proceeding with the work.

ROLE

Date

Payment Terms:

40% payable at Notice 60% payable at Distribution



Detailed Budget

Atticus Services & Cost Description

DESCRIPTION		UNI	TS	SUBTOTAL
NOTICE MAILING (Data Cleansing & Analysis) Mailed First Class		30	Class Mbrs	\$1,457
Class Data List - Cleaning & Processing		4.00	Hrs	\$494
Class Notice Review - Proof/Finalize/Print Set-Up		4.00	Hrs	\$49
PRINTING Class Notice 10 pgs: 5 shts doublesided	10	300	Printed Pages	\$41
Postage Stamp (within 1 ounce max weight)	·	30	ct to mail	\$1
Undeliverable/ NCOA /Retum Mail Processing & Remail (10%)		3	10% of class	\$2
Notice Request Re-Mailing		1	3% of class	\$
PROJECT MANAGEMENT		21	hrs	\$2,41
TECHNICAL SET UP (includes project kick-off)		3	hrs	\$34
COMMUNICATIONS				\$513
Telephone - Set-Up + Monthly Fee		6 Months		\$19
Telephone - Messages/IVR and live support		6 Months		\$18
PO Box - Setup & Monthly Fee		6 Months		\$10
Correspondence - Mail		various		\$3
FUND, TREASURY & TAX Reporting				\$1,31
Set-Up QSF		2.00	Hrs	\$26
Prepare/File Annual Fund Return, Payroll, Unemployment, Wage & Tax Forms		8.00	Hrs	\$1,04
Print 1099 & W2's		30	1099's W2's	\$1
DISTRIBUTION, Payment Calculations & Reporting				\$2,85
Cover Letter & Check - Design/Review/Finalize		4.00	Hrs	\$49
Payment Data - Calculate & Verify Payments		6.00	Hrs	\$74
Prepare Payment Reports		4.00	Hrs	\$49
Check - Print Set-up/Printing/Mail Prep		30		\$19
Check Mailing Postage (will be 1x mailings)		30	mailed	\$1
Check - Undeliverable/ NCOA /Return Mail Processing & Remail (7% Return)		4	7.0% est	\$17
Bank Fees (Account Set-Up & Monthly Fee)		6	months	\$73
DATA STORAGE		n/a		\$(
Small Case Discount				(317
		TOTAL		\$8,577

Operating Assumptions

- Class Size: 30 class members.
- Class Notice form 10 pages for each notice (English only) double sided printing, Price includes postage and handling fees.
- Data review, cleansing and preparing file for mailing; including NCOA, and new address searches, and skip tracing if required.
- All class members that do not Opt-Out will received a check and tax document(s).
- Communications includes, PO BOX, Mail Correspondence,
- Communications includes 800# with live phone operators and IVR.
- Project management assumes 24 hours at a blended rate of \$115 per hour. Includes summary reporting on a weekly basis.
- Qualified Settlement fund assumes 6 months.
 Price tax reporting both state and federal returns. All bank fees are included in pricing.
- Disbursement includes positive pay "anti-fraud" features.
- Not to Exceed \$10,000 in Administrative Fees



Thank you



Mike Gelhar
Director of QSF & Treasury Services

612-383-2503 (Direct) mgelhar@atticusadmin.com

1250 Northland Drive NE Suite 240 Mendota Heights MN 55120

Exhibit 3



PAGA NOTICE PUBLIC SEARCH - CASE DETAIL

Case Information

Case Number: LWDA-CM-543261-18 Plaintiff for PAGA Case: James Lawson

Filer/Attorney for PAGA Case: Byron Goldstein

Law Firm for PAGA Plaintiff: Goldstein, Borgen, Dardarian & Ho

Employer: Consumer Portfolio Services, Inc.

Date Case Received: Filer for Employer: Employer Filer Firm:

Court Type: California Superior Courts
Court Name: Orange County Superior Court

PAGA Court Case Number: 30-2018-01021149-CU-OE-CXC

Violation Type: Related BOFE Case:

Attachments

Attachment Name	Description	Date Submitted	Туре
Proposed Settlement on 10/17/7073 07:34:08	Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Plaintiffs Motion for Preliminary Approval.PDF	10/12/2023 9:34 PM	Proposed Settlement
Court Complaint Submitted on 09/27/2018 04:04:39 PM by Laura	Lawson v Consumer Portfolio Services, Inc File-Stamped Copy of Complaint.pdf	9/27/2018 11:04 PM	Court Complaint
Court Complaint Submitted on 10/17/2023 02:47:36 PM by Mengfei Sun	CPS First Amended Complaint.PDF	10/17/2023 9:47 PM	Court Complaint
Proposed Settlement Submitted on 10/12/2023 02:34:08 PM by Mengfei Sun	Executed Lawson Settlement Agreement.PDF	10/12/2023 9:34 PM	Proposed Settlement